

## 11.368 - Reaction Paper 4

I found the first two excerpts contained in the Rechtshaffen piece to be the most interesting part of this week's reading. I think that the Anderton article is especially misleading. It claims that “the percentage of Black persons in census tracts with Treatment Storage and Disposal Facilities (TSDFs) is approximately the same as in tracts without TSDFs.”

The authors' method has a serious flaw -- it does not account for census tracts which are part of Standard Metropolitan Statistical Areas (SMSAs) without TSDFs. The authors only analyzed SMSAs which contained TSDFs. I'd like to know what percentage of SMSAs contain TSDFs, but I cannot imagine that is more than 25%. Additionally, as the name implies, is some other grouping used for census tracts outside of metropolitan areas? Clearly, there are a large number of census tracts which do not contain TSDFs which were excluded from the study. I would assume that these tracts probably have a much lower concentration of minorities than those reported in the Anderton study. If this is the case, the study should have concluded that census tracts which contain TSDFs have a higher percentage of minorities. Instead, the only thing that the Anderton study truly proved was that census tracts which contain minorities and those close by all have the same percentage of minorities.

The Been article was equally interesting but for a different reason. Been concluded that the presence of Blacks in a census tract had no bearing on whether that tract would draw

new sitings of TSDFs. Additionally, Been found that at a later point in time (1990), there was a positive correlation between the percentage of Blacks living in a tract and the presence TSDFs. Given that Been concluded that her market dynamics scenario was not supported by the data, she seems to contradict herself. According to the Notes at the end of the article, Been attributes this inconsistency to the existence of TSDFs in Black neighborhoods prior to 1970. This seems like a good excuse to ignore the inconsistency. It would be helpful to know how many TSDFs existed in predominantly Black neighborhoods in 1970 and compare this number to the statistic from 1990. Any increase should indicate that Been's study was flawed.