

24.400: Proseminar in Philosophy I

Fall 2013

“Boston” designates ‘Boston’

Read the excerpt from Quine’s *Mathematical Logic*, then do Cartwright’s problem sets and the following exercises:

Exercise 1 (modified from JC Beall)

Let α be any English expression. Following Smullyan, define *the norm of α* to be α followed by its quotation name.

- i. What is the norm of ‘the expression’?
- ii. What, if anything, does the norm of ‘the expression’ denote?
- iii. What is the norm of ‘the norm of’?
- iv. What, if anything, does the norm of ‘the norm of’ denote?

Exercise 2

Assume double quotation-marks are used for mentioning expressions.

‘You are sad,’ the Knight said in an anxious tone: ‘let me sing you a song to comfort you.’

‘Is it very long?’ Alice asked, for she had heard a good deal of poetry that day.

‘It’s long,’ said the Knight, ‘but very, *very* beautiful. Everybody that hears me sing it -- either it brings the *tears* into their eyes, or else -- ’

‘Or else what?’ said Alice, for the Knight had made a sudden pause.

‘Or else it doesn’t, you know. The name of the song is called “*Haddock’s Eyes*.”’

‘Oh, that’s the name of the song, is it?’ Alice said, trying to feel interested.

‘No, you don’t understand,’ the Knight said, looking a little vexed. ‘That’s what the name is *called*. The name really is “*The Aged Aged Man*.”’¹

‘Then I ought to have said “That’s what the *song* is called”?’ Alice corrected herself.

‘No, you oughtn’t: that’s quite another thing! The *song* is called “*Ways and Means*”: but that’s only what it’s *called*, you know!’

‘Well, what *is* the song, then?’ said Alice, who was by this time completely bewildered.

‘I was coming to that,’ the Knight said. ‘The song really is “*A-sitting On A Gate*”: and the tune’s my own invention.’

...She stood and listened very attentively, but no tears came into her eyes.

¹ Cf. D. Graff Fara, “You can call me ‘stupid’, . . . just don’t call me stupid”, *Analysis* 71, 2011: 492–501.

'I'll tell thee everything I can; There's little to relate. I saw an aged aged man, A-sitting on a gate. "Who are you, aged man?" I said. "and how is it you live?" And his answer trickled through my head Like water through a sieve...

i. Add, if necessary, quotation marks to A and B to restore truth:

A. *Haddocks' Eyes = The Aged Aged Man*

B. *The Aged Aged Man = Ways and Means*

ii. What is the first word of the song?

MIT OpenCourseWare
<http://ocw.mit.edu>

24.400 Proseminar in Philosophy I
Fall 2013

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: <http://ocw.mit.edu/terms>.